

The Achievements and Failures of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC)

Prakriti Bhattarai
MA 2nd Semester
Padmakanya Multiple Campus
bhattaraiprakriti689@gmail.com

Received: January 2, 2025 Revised: February 19, 2025 Accepted: May 8, 2025

1. Abstract

This study explores both the achievements and failures of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) within the socio-political and economic context of South Asia. Established in 1985, SAARC was envisioned as a regional bloc to foster economic collaboration, cultural exchange, and social development among its eight member states—Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka. Despite nearly four decades of existence, SAARC has struggled to become a strong regional organization akin to the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) or the European Union (EU).

This research adopts a qualitative methodology, incorporating case studies, expert interviews, and document analysis to provide a nuanced understanding of SAARC's trajectory. While SAARC has made notable progress in areas such as disaster management, trade agreements, and cultural exchanges, its effectiveness has been constrained by geopolitical tensions—especially between India and Pakistan—economic disparities, and the absence of a robust enforcement mechanism. By drawing comparisons with ASEAN and the EU, this study seeks to analyze SAARC's challenges and propose recommendations for enhancing its role in regional cooperation.

2. Introduction

South Asia is one of the most complex and diverse regions in the world, home to over 1.8 billion people and encompassing a rich tapestry of cultures, languages, and economies. Recognizing the need for regional integration, SAARC was established in 1985 as a platform to promote collaboration in trade, health, education, technology, and other key areas. However, despite its promising objectives, SAARC's overall impact remains limited.

Several factors contribute to SAARC's struggles, including longstanding political hostilities—particularly between India and Pakistan—bureaucratic inefficiencies, and economic imbalances among member states. Unlike ASEAN, which has successfully integrated its economies and maintained political neutrality, SAARC remains hindered by internal disputes that obstruct regional cooperation. This study aims to explore the reasons behind SAARC's limited success, identify key achievements, and propose strategies for overcoming its challenges.

The central research question guiding this study is:

Why has SAARC not achieved its full potential as a regional bloc, and what lessons can be drawn from its experiences?

Understanding SAARC's successes and failures is crucial for shaping its future and ensuring that regional integration efforts in South Asia can be more effective.

3. Literature Review

The literature review assesses the key themes related to SAARC's development, focusing on its regional impact, successes, and challenges.

3.1 Regional Cooperation and Integration

- Acharya, A. (2012) in *Theoretical Foundations of Regional Cooperation* discusses the evolution of regionalism in Asia and its theoretical underpinnings.
- Comparative analysis with other regional blocs such as ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asian Nations) and the European Union (EU) provides insights into why SAARC has lagged behind.

3.2 Achievements of SAARC

- Hussain, S. (2016) in *SAARC's Role in Social Development* highlights successful initiatives such as:
 - The SAARC Food Bank
 - The South Asian Free Trade Area (SAFTA)
 - Cooperation in disaster management and health (e.g., COVID-19 response mechanisms)
- These projects demonstrate SAARC's potential to foster regional integration.

3.3 Failures and Challenges

- Bhatta, P. (2013) in *Political Roadblocks in SAARC* addresses the core issue of political tensions, particularly the India-Pakistan conflict, which has stifled the association's progress.
- Bureaucratic inefficiencies and a lack of enforcement mechanisms hinder effective policy implementation.

3.4 External Influences on SAARC

- Banerjee, S. (2015) examines the role of global powers such as China, the US, and the EU in shaping SAARC's trajectory.
- While China has shown growing interest in South Asian trade and infrastructure (e.g., the Belt and Road Initiative), the absence of a cohesive SAARC strategy limits the region's global influence.

The literature indicates that while SAARC has had some success in fostering cooperation, political disputes, economic disparities, and a lack of enforcement mechanisms remain major barriers to its success.

4. Statement of the Problem

Despite nearly 40 years of existence, SAARC has failed to evolve into a powerful regional organization comparable to ASEAN or the EU. This research investigates why SAARC continues to struggle despite its potential and how it can overcome its persistent challenges. Key problems include:

1. Geopolitical tensions, especially between India and Pakistan, which frequently derail SAARC summits and initiatives.
2. Economic disparities, with India's dominance creating imbalances in regional cooperation.
3. Weak institutional structures, making policy enforcement nearly impossible.
4. Lack of political will, with member states prioritizing national interests over regional integration.

This study seeks to understand these challenges while assessing SAARC's role in fostering regional cooperation.

5. Research Objectives

This study aims

To evaluate SAARC's achievements in fostering regional cooperation.

To analyze the political and structural factors contributing to its failures.

To compare SAARC's effectiveness with that of ASEAN and the EU.

6. Methodology

This research adopts a qualitative approach, employing case studies, content analysis, and expert interviews.

6.1 Research Design

- Comparative Analysis: Examining SAARC's performance in contrast with ASEAN and the EU.
- Case Studies: Focusing on specific SAARC initiatives (e.g., SAFTA and disaster management programs).

6.2 Data Collection

- Primary Sources:
 - Official SAARC documents (charters, declarations, meeting records).
 - Interviews with policymakers, diplomats, and regional experts.
- Secondary Sources:
 - Academic books, journals, and policy reports.

6.3 Data Analysis

- Content Analysis to identify patterns in SAARC's achievements and failures.
- Thematic Coding to analyze qualitative interviews and policy discussions.

6.4 Limitations

- Potential bias in secondary data.
- Challenges in accessing government officials for interviews.
- Variations in data quality across SAARC member states.

7. Expected Results and Discussion

This research aims to provide a comprehensive analysis of SAARC's achievements, failures, and potential as a regional organization. By evaluating its historical trajectory and comparing it with successful regional blocs such as ASEAN and the EU, the discussion will highlight critical lessons and strategies for improving SAARC's effectiveness.

7.1 Achievements of SAARC

Despite political challenges, SAARC has achieved several milestones in promoting regional cooperation:

7.1.1 Socioeconomic Development Initiatives

SAARC has introduced key socioeconomic programs, including:

- The SAARC Development Fund (SDF): Established to finance regional projects focusing on social, economic, and infrastructure development.
- SAARC Food Bank: Aims to ensure food security during crises and enhance regional cooperation in agricultural development.
- SAARC Disaster Management Centre (SDMC): Assists in disaster preparedness, mitigation, and response, crucial for a region frequently affected by natural disasters.

7.1.2 Trade and Economic Cooperation

Economic collaboration has been one of the core objectives of SAARC, with notable initiatives including:

- South Asian Free Trade Area (SAFTA): Launched in 2006 to promote intra-regional trade by reducing tariffs among member states.
- SAARC Agreement on Trade in Services (SATIS): Seeks to expand trade in services such as banking, tourism, and communication.

Although these agreements have improved trade within the region, intra-SAARC trade remains below 5% of total trade, compared to ASEAN's 25%.

7.1.3 Cultural and Educational Exchange

SAARC has fostered cultural diplomacy through:

- SAARC Youth Exchange Programs and scholarships.
- The SAARC University in New Delhi, promoting higher education and research collaboration.

7.2 Failures and Challenges

While SAARC has made progress, it faces several critical challenges that hinder its effectiveness.

7.2.1 Political Conflicts and Interstate Rivalries

The India-Pakistan rivalry has severely restricted SAARC's ability to function as a unified regional organization. Key issues include:

- Border disputes and historical tensions between India and Pakistan.
- Lack of consensus on major initiatives, leading to frequent disruptions in SAARC summits.
- Absence of a dispute resolution mechanism, unlike the ASEAN Way, which emphasizes informal diplomacy and conflict management.

7.2.2 Lack of Implementation and Institutional Weaknesses

One of SAARC's biggest drawbacks is its lack of enforcement power:

- SAARC operates on the principle of unanimity, making decision-making slow and inefficient.
- Agreements such as SAFTA and SATIS remain largely underutilized due to protectionist policies of member states.
- SAARC lacks a supranational authority, unlike the European Commission in the EU, which can enforce policies across member states.

7.2.3 Economic Disparities and Trade Barriers

- The South Asian region is characterized by wide economic disparities, with India being the dominant economy (nearly 80% of SAARC's GDP).
- Many member countries maintain non-tariff barriers and politically motivated trade restrictions, undermining economic cooperation.
- Infrastructural bottlenecks and poor connectivity limit trade flows within SAARC, unlike ASEAN's well-developed supply chain networks.

7.2.4 External Influences and Regional Geopolitics

- SAARC faces competition from China, which has expanded its presence in South Asia through the Belt and Road Initiative (BRI).
- India has sought alternative regional frameworks such as BIMSTEC, further weakening SAARC's relevance.
- The role of the United States and the European Union in South Asia influences SAARC's ability to independently navigate regional challenges.

7.3 Comparative Analysis with ASEAN and the EU

A comparison of SAARC with other regional organizations highlights potential lessons:

7.3.1 ASEAN's Success in Regional Integration

- Political Neutrality: ASEAN has been able to function effectively despite political differences between its members.
- Consensus-Based Cooperation: ASEAN operates through informal diplomacy, whereas SAARC struggles due to rigid unanimity rules.
- Economic Integration: ASEAN has an efficient trade bloc (AFTA), whereas SAARC's trade initiatives remain ineffective.

7.3.2 The EU's Institutional Strengths

- The EU has a supranational authority (the European Commission) that enforces policies across member states.
- The EU has successfully implemented economic integration, while SAARC has failed to remove trade barriers.

7.4 Proposed Strategies for Strengthening SAARC

To overcome its challenges, SAARC must adopt the following strategies:

1. Institutional Reforms:
 - Introduce majority-based decision-making instead of unanimity.

- Establish a permanent SAARC Secretariat with enforcement powers.
2. Enhancing Economic Cooperation:
 - Expand SAFTA and remove non-tariff barriers to increase intra-regional trade.
 - Invest in regional infrastructure and connectivity projects.
 3. Conflict Resolution Mechanisms:
 - Create diplomatic mediation platforms to ease inter-state tensions.
 - Establish a neutral SAARC peace commission to resolve disputes.
 4. Strengthening People-to-People Ties:
 - Expand educational exchanges and scholarships.
 - Encourage joint cultural and sports events to promote regional identity.

This discussion highlights SAARC's achievements, shortcomings, and prospects. While the organization has made strides in regional cooperation, its political divisions and economic inefficiencies limit its effectiveness. By implementing institutional reforms, boosting trade, and resolving inter-state conflicts, SAARC can transform into a more functional regional bloc, driving South Asia's development and integration.

8. Conclusion

This study concludes that while SAARC has made significant progress in promoting regional dialogue, its effectiveness remains hindered by geopolitical tensions, weak institutional structures, and lack of political commitment. To enhance SAARC's role, the following recommendations are proposed:

1. Strengthening SAARC's Institutional Framework
 - Introduce majority-based decision-making instead of unanimity.
 - Establish a permanent SAARC Secretariat with enforcement powers.
2. Enhancing Economic Integration
 - Expand SAFTA by removing non-tariff barriers.
 - Invest in regional infrastructure and connectivity projects.
3. Conflict Resolution Mechanisms
 - Develop a neutral mediation platform.
4. Strengthening People-to-People Ties
 - Expand educational exchanges and cultural programs.

By implementing these reforms, SAARC can transform into an effective regional bloc, driving South Asia's integration and development.

8. References

1. Acharya, A. (2012). *Theoretical Foundations of Regional Cooperation*. Routledge.
2. Ahmed, I. (2010). *SAARC: Challenges and Opportunities*. Sage Publications.
3. Bhatta, P. (2013). *Political Roadblocks in SAARC*. Journal of South Asian Studies.
4. Banerjee, S. (2015). *External Influences on South Asian Regionalism*. South Asia Policy Journal.
5. Hussain, S. (2016). *SAARC's Role in Social Development*. Cambridge Journal of Regions.
6. Rana, P. B., & Chia, W.-M. (2014). *Comparative Regionalism in Asia: ASEAN, EU, and SAARC*. Palgrave Macmillan.
7. SAARC Secretariat (2021). *SAARC Annual Report 2020-2021*. Kathmandu: SAARC Publication.
8. World Bank (2020). *Regional Economic Integration in South Asia: Opportunities and Challenges*.

10. Appendices

Timeline of Key Events in SAARC History

- 1985: Formation of SAARC.
- 2006: Establishment of SAFTA (South Asian Free Trade Area).
- 2020: SAARC's collective response to COVID-19.